

**MINUTES  
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
(RESCHEDULED) MEETING OF JANUARY 20, 2011**

**City HZC Present**

Sean Bolen  
Scott Busby  
Faris Eid  
Lorie Huff  
Sandra Martin  
Melissa McAdams  
Andie Ray  
Finbarr Saunders  
Melynda Whetsel

**County HZC Present**

Linda Claussen  
Steve Cotham  
Charles Faulkner  
Kenneth Gresham  
Carol Montgomery

**Others Present:**

Joshua Wright  
Daniel Sanders  
Lauren Rider  
Brian Pittman  
James Pierce  
Arin Streeter  
Cynthia Stancil  
John Craig  
Margot Kline  
Ann Bennett  
Charlotte West

Chair Finbarr Saunders called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

**MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE DECEMBER 30, 2010 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

**2333 Jefferson Avenue** - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - John Wampler, High Oaks Construction – Certificate No. 120710EDG - Repair and install porch rail, mimicking existing square cut spindles set into top and bottom rail; repair or replace porch flooring in kind; rear siding in kind; install chimney flashing; repair rear decking.

**1603 Jefferson Avenue** - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Kent Kendrick – Certificate No. 120810EDGA - Replace porch decking in kind.

**1605 Jefferson Avenue** - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Kent Kendrick – Certificate No. 120810EDGB - Replacement of soffit on structure in kind.

**716 Deery Street** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1 - Kent Kendrick – Certificate No. 103114G (Reissue of Certificate #40500FG) - 1) Convert rear, side elevation window (north side) to door and add stoop. Approximate dimension of porch 5'x6' with wood floor and skirting of lattice. Door to be full view (salvage from YMCA). Hipped roof supported by columns and trim to resemble front porch.

2) Replace fascia, soffit, corbels and other wooden trim members in kind preparatory to painting. Repair and replace elements of second story porch on front elevation in kind, as necessary.

**MOTION BY MARTIN AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO RECEIVE THE LEVEL 1 CERTIFICATE REPORT. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Certificates of Appropriateness

Bennett distributed plans for the new house on Luttrell Street for Brian Pittman to be allowed to use transoms above the windows. Commissioners asked Mr. Pittman at the November meeting to provide examples of other windows in the area.

Brian Pittman, 623 W. Hill Avenue, stated that the Commission asked him for photos of other buildings and what this house would look like with a transom. Bennett stated that the Commission approved the transoms over the windows provided examples could be found. She stated that 900 Luttrell has the same window in a transom.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO CONFIRM THESE DRAWINGS ARE SUFFICIENT FOR APPROVAL. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

**Market Square H-1**

**407 Union Avenue** – Joshua Wright, Architects Wright (Applicant) - Market Square Hotel LLC (Owner) – Certificate No. 10611MKT

**Work Description**

Replace existing concrete at Union Avenue entry with rectangular stained concrete paving with brick paver margins, with The Oliver Hotel in metal lettering embedded in stained concrete; replace existing entry with central pivoting door with one light, flanked by two 3'6" sidelights with central light and three light transom; and secondary door with two paneled fixed enclosure with large pane windows in each panel topped by transoms; all doors openings to be in wood casing. Add new uplighting at existing outlet locations on south elevation. Remove existing awning and banners. Repair and repaint existing wrought iron balcony and columns and cover balcony floor grate with galvanized flashing painted to match existing wrought iron structure. Remove existing sign and hand new blade sign from balcony. Place "Oliver Hotel" decals on existing sconces. Install new primary sign tentatively proposed as a 12' tall by 3' wide blade sign with a 5' wide base, with letters to be lit internally with exposed bulbs. Install new awning coverings on each elevation with existing columns painted black and awning coverings to be black. Repoint and repaint brick as necessary, including infilling existing steel beam. Cover holes in fall at recessed entry with stucco, repainting exit and replacing steel door with steel door. Replace existing flashing with copper flashing. Remove existing brick veneer at columns on south elevation and replace with brick veneer matching original brick in size and layout.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate 10611MKT. The proposed work items are consistent with the Market Square Design Guidelines, and with the Secretary of Interior's Standards, necessary in order to pursue preservation tax incentives.

### **Additional Comments**

Special attention should be paid to the proposed blade sign to be located on the southwest corner of the building. The applicants are concerned that signage for the hotel portion of the building be visible from Market and from Union, and also that the sign be historically appropriate without intruding on the architectural statement of the building itself.

Joshua Wright, 111 N. Central, Suite 100, stated that they plan to use two blade signs, one at entrance and other on the corner of Union Avenue and Market Square.

Eid asked what the maximum sign size is, and Mr. Wright is using a sign smaller than the maximum. Eid asked about the front door being a pivot door. Bennett responded that they have been used before. Busby asked if the bottom panels are glass and Wright said they are.

John Craig, 226 Brighton Court, stated that Mr. Wright presented the drawings to the Market Square Association. As long as they are consistent with the Market Square Guidelines and *Secretary's Standards*, the Association is fine with the plan. Bennett stated that the owners intend to apply for tax credits. Mr. Craig asked Bennett about the guidelines for Market Square and Secretary's Standards not being exactly the same. She said that the *Secretary Standards* should be used first and then the Market Square Guidelines if it is not in the *Secretary's Standards*. Market Square is working on revising their guidelines.

Bennett stated that an application for 28 Market Square will be heard in February. The document Preservation Brief #14 explains this.

Busby stated that the doors should be a single panel door without the glass at the bottom, with a taller base of wood in proportion to the door. He would prefer the door not pivot. Mr. Wright responded that he would be glad to change the bottom to wood and leave glass at the top.

Eid thinks the design of the sign is too plain and does not do justice to the building. Mr. Wright may want to change to a sign that looks more like the historic Kerns sign. It will be at a 45 degree angle from the corner of Union Avenue and Market Square.

Bolen wants the guidelines followed. He did not see in the Market Square Guidelines to default to the *Secretary's Standards*. Bennett responded that you cannot default to the *Secretary's Standards*. They were written for everything from boats to buildings. They do not address specific architecture. There may not be a need for neighborhood guidelines later because of all the Preservation Briefs being added.

Mr. Craig stated that it might be worthwhile to go through the Market Square Guidelines. The *Secretary's Standards* will define 90 percent and Market Square Guidelines would address the rooftop space or visibility standard. We want some consistency for the square. Bolen stated that

the Commission needs legal counsel to discuss this issue. This is contrary to what he understood. Mr. Craig stated that the law refers back to the *Secretary's Standards*, and we should be consistent. Bennett responded that in an area where tax credits are used, it is critical to let owners use tax credits. If we send the owner a wrong message, it could cause us to lose the district. Bolen asked if each project could have a reference back to the *Secretary's Standards* so they could read and compare them. Bennett stated they are online. Eid asked if the front complies. Bennett stated that if the entry was wood, she thinks it would comply. There is no problem with the sign.

**MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE SIGN AS SUBMITTED AND SIGN BE SUBMITTED AT A LATER TIME WITH THE FINALIZED PLANS FOR THE FRONT DOORS, WHICH SHOULD BE WOOD AT THE BOTTOM AND THE SIDE LIGHT BE A FULL GLASS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

### **Fourth & Gill H-1**

*714 Haynes Place* – Daniel Sanders (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 106114G

#### **Work Description**

Install new wood double sash windows, with one over one lights, to replace existing rotted out three over one windows. Structure has 32 windows, all of which are extremely deteriorated and cannot be repaired but should be replaced. Three light sashes are not available except in custom windows, and in custom windows would not be true divided lights.

#### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 106114G. There are 28 windows in this building, all of which are deteriorated due to lack of maintenance by a previous owner. They must be replaced, and replacement windows with three light upper sashes are not available.

#### **Additional Comments**

The design guidelines call for exact replacements if windows must be replaced; exact replacements are not available. The style of this building does not particularly call for divide upper sashes; 1/1 sashes were commonly used in this time period and for this style.

Bennett stated it would be acceptable to replace the 32 windows with 1/1 windows, as would have been common in buildings of this time period and design. She noted a letter received from Jeff Tallman of Wells Fargo supporting Mr. Sanders' application. Mr. Tallman has no problem aesthetically with the windows being proposed. Sanders' increased renovation costs are due to the dereliction and negligence of the previous owner, which has constrained his budget.

Arin Streeter, 120 S. Gay Street, the neighborhood does not think replacing these windows is in conflict with the guidelines; however, they should be the same as the original windows. True divided light windows are not available, but the Commission has approved windows using simulated divided light. The neighborhood does not want windows with the dividers glued to the outside. New designs have been developed since the guidelines were written.

Daniel Sanders, 10209 Asheville Highway, stated that he is an attorney for the Knox County Law Department with a personal and professional interest in vacant and deteriorated properties. This house should have been condemned. He has had the wiring replaced, and following rehab, plans to live in the house. It has 32 windows and with the windows in the basement, it makes a total of 39. This is a duplex with two electrical and plumbing systems. The \$24,000 for windows is out of his price range. He has read the guidelines. If he had the windows made, they still would not be exactly like the original. One over ones were used during this time period. Simulated mutttons are too expensive and rebuilding would be about the same cost.

Bolen talked to a contractor working in Old North, and he said it would cost \$300 a window to rebuild them. Sanders got a quote of \$250 to repair per sash, for a total of \$500 per window; the result would still be that the windows would be single pane. Some of the windows are rotten, leading to the high cost of repair.

Whetsel stated that she has talked to Mr. Sanders about this project, and she agrees with Mr. Streeter that the guidelines should be followed with the same size, shape and pattern design. The neighborhood might work with the applicant and ask the Commission to look at a compromise of replacing the front windows with simulated 3/1 sash windows, replacing the remaining windows in increments.

Mr. Sanders responded that to replace all the windows is over his budget. Maybe he could only replace the ones on the front with simulated windows. There are six windows on the front. True divided lights are not available. Simulated divided windows are too expensive for him. Bennett noted that there is a provision for economic hardship, and the replacing of 39 windows might meet this hardship. Mr. Sanders would be willing to comprise to set a condition that only the front should be simulated, and the next time they need to be replaced, replica windows could be installed throughout the house.

Busby stated that it looks like the side windows are also visible from the street, and Whetsel said they are. Saunders stated that he is glad Mr. Sanders has talked to Whetsel and Mr. Streeter. McAdams likes the front windows being simulated and the rest being true divided. Bolen stated he will help Mr. Sanders meet with contractors who repair windows and feels the Commission must enforce the guidelines.

**MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY RAY TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

### **Old North Knoxville**

***1417 Cornelia Avenue*** – Old North Restorations, LLC (Applicant) – Jared Brewster (Owner) – Certificate No. 10611ONK

### **Work Description**

Complete exterior restoration and addition, including modification of roof shape to correct burn damage and to add second story bedrooms, including shed dormers, reworking of gable shapes, and installing roof covering; repair masonry using Preservation Brief No. 2; adding two exterior

doors (half-view on front and rear); Add one over one replacement windows at all locations to match size of old window openings, plus small horizontal windows on stair and on opposite side elevation and small one over one double hungs in dormers; add roof covering after tearing off and rebuilding existing unstable roof; add round sawn wood gable vent in front opening, to match existing size, or add round window to match existing size.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate 10611ONK. This application itemizes the work necessary to complete the project begun by the previous owner, and will result in saving the building and returning it to an appearance consistent with the adopted design guidelines.

### **Additional Comments**

The work approved by the HZC in 2009 was as follows:

Retain front and side walls of existing fire-damaged structure and build new structure behind it. New building will retain existing front entry and porch, and from portion of hip and lower cross gables. Replacement windows will be installed to reflect the full dimension of the original windows, wood double hung, with new windows in the same dimensions as shown on the attached plans. Interior chimney retained. Bay window retained. Wood siding repaired and restored or replaced in kind, with 3-1/2" corner boards. Modifications to west elevation will include shed roofed dormers, one three light and one one light, to allow living space on second story level. Side porch, accessed from rear of house, will include sawn wood balusters set into top and bottom rail, with 10" square wood column. East elevation will include replacing windows with windows sized to fit original window openings. Front elevation will retain original fishscale patterned trim and attic vent on front gable, with windows sized to fit original window openings and will retain front porch.

Common features throughout the house - two over one windows; originally size window openings as revealed by removal of artificial siding; installation of ridge vent and asphalt shingle roof; restoration of wood siding; corner boards, skirt board, and sawn wood gable vents; installation of columns on front and side porch; restoration of brick chimney.

Modifications added at HZC meeting: 1/1 double hung windows are acceptable; corner boards to be 5-1/2"; dormers may be shed or gabled; additional window may be added on right side elevation; if removing artificial siding reveals other window openings, they may also be utilized.

The current owners have formed a neighborhood investment group for the purpose of completing the rehabilitation of this fire-damaged and partially completed building. The work contemplated takes into account alterations that were constructed under Mr. Brewster's direction before he abandoned the building.

Lauren Rider, 229 E. Scott Avenue, stated she is representing an investment group made up of neighbors who are partnering to use community development funds to save the house. She discussed the drawings that show the new window placement. The house has been exposed to the

elements and waterlogged for three years. There are two bays; the only remaining window in one of the bays has 2/1 windows but the architectural description notes 1/1 windows and the work description calls for 1/1. Bennett stated there is no way to tell what type of windows were there originally, but 1/1 sashes would have been appropriate.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, stated that the neighborhood agrees with the staff recommendation. They do not like the shed dormers because they are not appropriate for this house but since the change has already been constructed, are willing to accept those dormers since it will result in saving the entire structure. They appreciate their neighbors taking on this project.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Saunders turned the meeting over to Kenneth Gresham, Knox County Commission Chair. Gresham stated that at the November meeting, Commission nominated him to continue as chair and Steve Cotham as vice chair. The vote was unanimous for Gresham as Chair and Steve Cotham as vice chair.

Saunders stated that the Commission is supposed to have an annual training session, and this presentation will qualify.

Gresham introduced Margot Kline who is speaking about saving the Admiral Farragut home place.

Margot Kline, 8845 Ebenezer Oak Lane, stated that she has been doing research on the Admiral Farragut home place because she lives close. She is interested in the historic preservation of this area. She is a member of First Families of Tennessee. She wants to bring in tourism to the area. She has been working with Knox Heritage, and this property is on their fragile 15 sites. This is not in the Town of Farragut. The objective is to open the road to expand Admiral Farragut Park all along the riverfront. She has determined which part of the land is public and which is private. She is asking both Historic Zoning Commissions to seek funding, because the adjacent land is for sale and may or may not have a negative impact on the monument. There may be grant money and Tennessee Department of Transportation money to preserve it because of the Civil War history. Love's Ferry is the official birthplace of Farragut. A greenway should be developed around the cove.

Gresham stated that the Commission is interested in the area being preserved, but he does not know what we can do. Bennett wrote a grant application to the Tennessee Historical Commission (THC) for funding to do exploratory archeological digs to see where the cabin stood. It may be at or close to the marker. Since the Commission does not have independent funding this is all the Commission can do. Kline stated the grant needs to be reworded because the state will not fund anything on private land.

**MOTION BY GRESHAM AND SECOND BY MONTGOMERY TO SECURE WHAT NEEDS TO BE DONE TO PRESERVE THE ADMIRAL FARRAGUT HOME PLACE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on February 17, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.