

AGENDA
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JUNE 18, 2009

- Call to Order
- Introduction of Visitors
- [Approval of Minutes – May 21, 2009, meeting](#)
- Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chair Melynda Whetsel
- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Old North Knoxville – H-1

[522 E. Scott Avenue](#) – William McGowan (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 51509ONK

Work Description

Replace siding, fascia, soffit and trim boards in kind, as necessary; replace roof on bay and over the kitchen on the southwest side of house with slate look alike shingles to allow adequate drainage from shallow pitched roof (APPROVED - LEVEL I); and, add 10' x 16' accessory structure at the rear of the house 13' off of the alley. Accessory building to have weatherboard or board and batten wall covering, asphalt shingle roof covering, gable roof with 18" overhang, and 6/12 slope, 2/2 double hung wood windows, and a pier foundation.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 51509ONK if roof slope is modified. (Level I portion of Certificate application was issued on 5/21/2009). Design guidelines for Accessory Buildings specifically require 12/12 roof pitch.

Additional Comments

All details of the proposed accessory building are appropriate except the roof pitch, which the design guidelines list as one of the elements. Alternative roof pitches are not included in the list. Mr. McGowan recounted that the application for the lower pitched roof was for two reasons: 1) the house is a corner lot, and reducing the pitch of the roof would result in a lower profile and less obvious installation; and 2) lowering the pitch would make installing a roof covering and working on the roof later much easier to accomplish.

309 E. Oklahoma Avenue – Dan Hugh (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 60209ONK

Work Description

Demolish existing garage and construct new garage using stuccoed foundation, wood board and batten type wall covering, windows duplicating the existing (6 light single sash) facing house and on each side elevation; board and batten door facing house, 10/12 hipped roof with dimensional shingles, and paired overhead doors resembling carriage doors with six lights and cross bracing facing alley. New garage dimensions 30'x22' with 11' setback from alley and six feet from south side property line.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 60209ONK. Information contained in the attached Sanborn maps show a garage constructed between 1924 and the 1950s.

Additional Comments

As you recall, Mr. Hugh's request for demolition of an existing garage and construction of a replacement structure was denied without prejudice at the May 21 meeting of the Commission; the Old North Knoxville representative reported to you that the Board had not had time to meet and consider the application. This delay created a negative change in Mr. Hugh's schedule, since he would like to have this matter resolved and the garage constructed before he is called out of the country on business later this summer.

The board of Old North Knoxville met on Monday, June 1 to consider the Hugh's request. After a very lengthy discussion, the ONK Board agreed with the demolition request and with the request for a replacement structure. Mr. Hugh presented a design of the replacement structure to more nearly duplicate the building being demolished. It was presented as a 22'x24' board and batten design with a hip roof with dimensional shingle covering, two carriage style garage doors facing the alley, complete with cross bracing, six light windows on each elevation and a board and batten door facing the house. That design was also approved by the Board.

On Tuesday, June 2, Mr. Hugh met with Mr. Tom Reynolds, who advised him that the Knoxville Zoning Ordinance would allow a building with a maximum size of 750 sq. ft. Following the meeting with Mr. Reynolds, Mr. Hugh modified the size of the structure to the information that is included in this Certificate application. The design details of the building (board and batten, hip roof, doors and windows) did not change. Only the size of the structure was modified by increasing the length from 24' to 30'. The ONK Board did not specifically discuss the proposed size of the building - only the design details. The proposal before you contains the design details that were discussed by the Board at the June 1 meeting.

Edgewood-Park City H-1

2019 Washington Avenue – Jordan Wilkerson (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 60409EDG

Work Description

Restore front of burned structure, including repair or replace wood siding, as necessary; repoint brick using Preservation Brief, No. 2 (low-content Portland) as necessary; reroofing using asphalt shingles and retaining or repairing bargeboard in front gable and wood attic vents; replacing or repairing wood windows (one over one double hung); repair original front porch with beadboard ceiling, wood tongue in groove floor, turned wood columns with sawn wood trim with front porch supported by existing brick foundation; construct rear addition with duplicate roof slope and materials as shown on attached plan with covered stoop.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 60409EDG. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines and will result in a rehabilitated building that is significant to the Edgewood-Park City H-1 district.

Additional Comments

Design Guidelines, Roofs, pg. 15; Windows, pg. 16; Porches, pg. 19; Entrances, pg. 21, Wall Coverings, pg. 23, Masonry, pg. 25

Market Square H-1

24 Market Square – Scott Schimmel (Applicant) – Mahastie Vafaie (Owner) – Certificate No. 52809MKT

Work Description

Replace failed double-pane shop windows, reducing number of windows from 12 to 4 by removing central dividing mullion. Transoms and kick panels will remain unchanged. There will now be four storefront windows tall enough to cover the distance from the kick panels to the bottom of the transoms; three will be on the left side of the entry and one on the right side; each will be tall enough to stretch from kick panel to transom, divided where the transom lines are now divided.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 52809MKT. Proposed work will modify the alterations that were made c. 1985, and bring the windows into alignment with the existing transoms.

4th & Gill H-1

805 Eleanor Street – Jeff Rusk (Applicant) – John Wampler (Owner) – Certificate No. 526094&G

Work Description

Construct new accessory building, 24'x24', with 20' setback from alley, sitting behind primary structure. 12/12 roof with wood siding, garage door opening to alley, one over one windows, and covered walkway supported by square wood columns.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 526094&G. Proposed work is consistent with recommendation for Outbuildings, P. 19 of adopted design guidelines.

940 Eleanor Street – Vanessa Todd (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 512094&G

Work Description

1) Remove side door and replace with wood window, matching design of remaining original windows but smaller, and with siding to match original; 2) Repair or replace in kind, as necessary, siding, soffit, and trim; 3) on rear of house, add French doors on first floor level to access deck; 4) install gutters; 5) remove rear, side stairs that led to second story landing and enclosed rear porch; 6) remove second story rear porch enclosure to open rear porch and install spindled railing with spindles matching originals and remove second story doors finishing with wood siding to match remainder of house; 7) remove metal windows added to basement, replacing most with wood single hung windows and eliminating two windows under stairs, rebrick foundation using soft mortar in accordance with Preservation Brief No. 2; 8) remove metal windows on rear of house and replace with wood double hung windows matching other windows on house; 9) repair garage foundation, removing metal siding that was obscuring it and replacing with concrete block foundation, repairing siding and framing as necessary, and adding new garage door appropriate to style of house.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 512094&G. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

Application includes both existing garage and house. Restoration of exterior is consistent with provisions under Wall Coverings, Wood, pgs. 13 and 14, Porches, pg. 12, Windows, pg. 10 and 11, Masonry, pg. 15, and Entrances, pg. 13. Alterations to existing rear elements will remove inappropriately placed elements that occurred when house was converted to multi-family housing; these elements have not acquired significance.

Mechanicsville H-1

213 Deaderick Street – Meadow Ridge Investments, Blaine Hopkins (Applicant/Owner)
– Certificate No. 60409MEC

Work Description

Siding: Repair existing siding, skirt board, corner boards, window trim and imbricated shingles in front gable as necessary.

Windows: 2/2 wood replacements. Replace missing ocular window on NW elevation.

Doors: Remove added front door on front elevation, replacing with paired windows and trim to mimic original window placement and trim. Replace primary front door with half or full view front door, either salvage or design to mimic appropriate entry.

Front porch: Repair beadboard ceiling as necessary. Repair or replace tongue in groove wood porch floor. Install new tapered 8" wood columns with Doric capitals, spaced to frame front steps and tripled on corner.

Roof: Install asphalt or fiberglass shingles.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 60409MEC with modifications to the proposed porch columns. The remainder of the proposed work is consistent with the adopted Mechanicsville Design Guidelines.

Additional Comments

The columns that were removed were large brick columns, inappropriate to the structure but heavy enough to support the large roof entablature. In order to balance that entablature, the columns need to be much larger in diameter, or they can be doubled and used in their proposed size. Columns should be paired, one on each side of the front entry, with paired or tripled columns at the corner of the porch.

General

300 Main Street – Public Building Authority, Jayne Burritt (Applicant) – Knox County Government (Owner) – Certificate No. 60109GEN

Work Description

Review window mock-up PBA was authorized to execute for possible replacement windows (Certificate No. 40209GEN); determine if one or both of the mock-ups, with some modification, is an acceptable replacement window.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 60109GEN if modifications are possible.

Additional Comments

Two manufacturers are represented - Marvin and Eagle. Because tooling up to produce the windows is extremely expensive, each has brought a sample window, nearly but not exactly a copy of the replacement. My comments address the issues I thought prevented the windows from being exact enough to be approvable. You may have additional issues. Representatives of each manufacturer will be present to answer questions about whether the exact duplicates are possible in these materials.

Eagle:

- 1) The window stoops are too small and have obvious piecing.
- 2) The horizontal beaded molding that separates the window from the transom is not an accurate reproduction of any of the courthouse windows.
- 3) The lugs (shaped pieces at the bottom of the upper sash) are too small.
- 4) The top window sash rails on each side should run the length of the sash with the lugs a continuation of that line; the top and bottom rails should be butted into the top rail.
- 5) The muntins in the transom should be wider and deeper to reflect the dimension of the existing.
- 6) The pattern of separation in the transom should duplicate the original.
- 7) The hardware, including pulls and sash locks, should replicate the original in size and weight, and may be reused from the existing windows or may be new.

Marvin:

- 1) The window stoops are too small and have obvious piecing.
- 2) The horizontal beaded molding that separates the window from the transom is not an accurate reproduction of any of the courthouse windows.³
- 3) There is too obvious a line visually separating the lugs from the sash.
- 4) The top window sash rails on each side should run the length of the sash with the lugs a continuation of that line; the top and bottom rails should be butted into the top rail.
- 5) The muntins in the transom should be wider and deeper to reflect the dimension of the existing.

In addition, it should be determined whether the metal framed windows can be reused.

Other Business

Solar Cities Presentation

[Discussion of fee increase](#)

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on July 16, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.